

RSSAC Meeting Minutes

3 October 2019 | 13:00-14:30 UTC

Attendance

Cogent	Paul Vixie
DISA	Kevin Wright, Ryan Stephenson
ICANN	Matt Larson, Terry Manderson
ISC	Fred Baker, Jeff Osborn
NASA	Keith Bluestein, Tom Miglin
Netnod	Lars-Johan Liman
RIPE NCC	Kaveh Ranjbar, Anand Buddhdev
UMD	Karl Reuss
USC ISI	Wes Hardaker, Suzanne Woolf
US ARL	Howard Kash, Ken Renard
Verisign	Brad Verd
WIDE	Hiro Hotta

Liaison to the Board	Kaveh Ranjbar
Liaison to the CSC	Lars-Johan Liman
Liaison to the RZERC	Brad Verd
Liaison from the SSAC	Russ Mundy
Liaison from the IAB	Daniel Migault
Liaison from the IANA Functions Operator	Naela Sarras
Liaison from the Root Zone Maintainer	Duane Wessels

Staff Andrew McConachie, Carlos Reyes, Danielle Rutherford, Ozan Sahin, and Steve Sheng

Action Items from this Meeting:

- Staff to publish the minutes from 3 September 2019 teleconference.
- Staff to send published minutes from 3 September 2019 teleconference to the RSSAC Caucus mailing list.
- Staff to capture three topics for the joint meeting with the ICANN Board and submit by 14 October 2019.
- Steve Sheng to circulate the link to draft workshop report.
- Staff to start an online vote on the workshop report after the stable period.
- Staff to circulate doodle polls to organize RSSAC Caucus calls in order to update RSSAC002v3.
- Naela Sarras to check if a draft plan report of the next KSK rollover is ready and Kim Davies would be available for a presentation at the DNSSEC workshop.

Call to Order

Fred Baker called the meeting to order at 13:00 UTC.

Roll Call

Fred Baker conducted a roll call. Quorum was present to conduct the meeting and to take formal action, if necessary.

Agenda Review

Fred Baker reviewed the agenda and there was no objection or requested additions.

Administration

Approval of Minutes

The RSSAC approved the draft minutes from the 3 September 2019 teleconference.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to publish the minutes from 3 September 2019 teleconference.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to send published minutes from 3 September 2019 teleconference to the RSSAC Caucus mailing list.

RSSAC Caucus Membership Committee Update

Carlos Reyes provided an update on the outreach to inactive RSSAC Caucus members. Carlos told the RSSAC that the Membership Committee had reached out to twenty-eight RSSAC Caucus members who had no participation or only participated in one RSSAC Caucus meeting since they joined. Carlos added that the Committee had heard from nine members, three of which asked to be removed. Carlos concluded that the Committee would continue tracking these inactive members, and he hoped to give a clearer picture of this outreach in Montreal.

Chair/Vice Chair Model Update

Carlos Reyes provided a brief background on the RSSAC Chair/Vice Chair model discussion which prompted changes to the ICANN Bylaws. Carlos articulated that the amendments to the ICANN Bylaws were adopted by the ICANN Board and were now in the Empowered Community consideration process. Carlos added that once the Empowered Community consideration period was finished the amendments to the Bylaws as well as RSSAC000v4 would come into effect. Carlos reminded the group of the discussions on the topic in Kobe.

According to these discussions, Carlos continued, Brad Verd's Co-Chair spot would become the new Vice Chair spot and Fred Baker would finish his two-year term, first year as a Co-Chair and second year as a Chair. Carlos noted that the RSSAC would elect the Vice Chair and the term would start by 1 January 2020.

Fred Baker asked Carlos whether Brad Verd could be the Vice Chair. Carlos responded that based on RSSAC000v3 and v4 a one-year break would be required. However, Carlos noted that it was up to the RSSAC to decide if the transition to Chair/Vice Chair model would impact this requirement as technically Vice Chair role was new.

Lars-Johan Liman commented that he was responsible for the “break requirement” paragraph and his interpretation was that this requirement would still apply to the Vice Chair role. Lars-Johan wondered about the nomination timeframe. Carlos replied that upon the conclusion of Empowered Community consideration process the usual timeframe would apply with a nomination period in November and an election in December.

Fred Baker came to the conclusion that based on his understanding, Brad Verd could not be nominated for the RSSAC Vice Chair role in December 2019 election.

Nominating Committee Organizational Review Update

Carlos Reyes reminded the group of a recommendation from the NomCom Organizational review which called for giving the RSSAC a vote on the Nominating Committee. Carlos reported that the Board had adopted the recommendation and the RSSAC was in a holding pattern as the Board was working through the recommendations. Carlos added that based on his conversations with the ICANN Legal Department it might end up being a situation where conversations happening about the governance model (RSSAC037) could complement NomCom Organizational Review process and everything could be done with one big change to the bylaws.

RSS Governance Update

Carlos Reyes provided a background on the public comment process regarding RSSAC037 and RSSAC038. He pointed out the feedback from the SSAC that they wanted to be part of the Governance Working Group (GWG). Carlos reported that ICANN Org. decided to accept this request. He then gave the floor to Kaveh Ranjbar to report on the Board Technical Committee (BTC) decision on the SSAC request.

Kaveh explained that the BTC discussions went smoothly and there were no major changes to the document. Kaveh added that discussions centered around whether changing the text would be appropriate after it went through the public comment process. Kaveh told the group that the document was sent to the ICANN Board with minor wordsmithing and the request from the SSAC was accepted. He expected that the ICANN Board would have a resolution in Montreal to form the GWG. The other update Kaveh provided was that Carlos Reyes was added to the BTC mailing list until the end of the Evolution of RSS Governance process.

Draft ICANN66 Schedule

Ozan Sahin talked through the draft RSSAC ICANN66 schedule. He mentioned two points for discussion. The first one about the RSSAC decision on which topics to submit by 14 October for a discussion with the ICANN Board in their joint meeting at ICANN66. The other one was whether RSSAC wanted to meet with the ICANN Finance Team for a presentation on the following topics;

- Five year operating plan and financial plan,
- FY21 operating plan,
- FY19 financials and FY20 updates,
- Accountability and transparency reporting

Brad Verd discussed that he did not think a lot of people would want to get a financial update. So he suggested receiving a financial update as Co-Chairs rather than taking the time of all RSSAC members or, as an alternative option, allocating fifteen minutes in one of the RSSAC meetings for such an update.

Lars-Johan Liman told the group that he was not looking for a financial update, but he wanted to know whether the finance team would be providing this update elsewhere in case anyone was interested in it.

Hearing no interest for a financial update from the participants Fred Baker moved to the topics for the joint meeting with the ICANN Board. Fred suggested one big topic would be what was going on with RSSAC037 and made a call for other topics from the group. Brad Verd proposed that another topic could be the threat mitigation narrative for the RSS. He suggested asking the ICANN Board to understand whether they think the RSSAC had been doing everything to address their concerns about this narrative. Kaveh Ranjbar recommended sharing the threat document with the ICANN Board beforehand for awareness. Fred Baker responded that the document was already shared with the ICANN Board about a month ago, but pointing them to the document before the joint meeting would make sense.

Carlos Reyes explained that in the current version of the RSSAC ICANN66 schedule the RSSAC Caucus meeting had a conflict with the OCTO session on Emerging Identifier Technology. To avoid this conflict Carlos suggested moving the RSSAC Caucus meeting to later on Tuesday, removing the RSSAC Information session, and rescheduling the RSSAC meeting to Wednesday 09:00-10:15 slot. Fred Baker and Brad Verd agreed that the suggestion from Carlos was reasonable.

Jeff Osborn asked whether it would make sense to add a discussion topic on Service Level Agreements (SLAs) for the joint meeting with the ICANN Board to see what they think. Kaveh Ranjbar responded that the Board was aware of the SLAs discussion and it would be valuable if that came from the RSSAC to the Board. Kaveh supported the idea of bringing this topic up. Fred Baker concluded that RSSAC had three discussion topics for the joint meeting with the ICANN Board with the addition of SLAs.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to capture three topics for the joint meeting with the ICANN Board and submit by 14 October 2019.

October 2019 Workshop Draft Report

Steve Sheng went over the draft workshop report. He particularly pointed out the middle paragraph which summarized the discussions that took place during the workshop. Steve committed to share the link to the draft workshop report after the meeting and outlined the next steps as the review period, vote and publication of the document.

ACTION ITEM: Steve Sheng to circulate the link to draft workshop report.

Fred Baker wanted to know if the vote would happen during RSSAC's November meeting. Steve Sheng responded that would be up to RSSAC to decide. Brad Verd recommended having an online vote and publishing the document before the ICANN public meeting, if possible.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to start an online vote on the workshop report after the stable period.

Work Items

RSS Metrics Work Party Update

Duane Wessels reported that almost all the time in the workshop was spent on the work of the Metrics Work Party. Duane summarized that the objective of the workshop was to go through individual metrics and measurements and come up with recommended thresholds which was accomplished for the most part. Duane noted that the next step would be editing the document in light of the discussions that took place. He pointed out the opportunities to advance the work through the teleconferences and meetings the work party would have with the aim of wrapping up the work and presenting the document to the RSSAC by the end of the year and a vote in January.

Modern Resolver Behavior Work Party Update

Paul Hoffman reported that the test bed was complete and although no one was really using it some people had looked at it. Paul explained that there was a fake route in the test bed so that it could sign using much shorter TTLs. He added that the tool he made to do the fake route had hardwired the sixty seconds in and he was in the last phases of making that tool part of the test bed. Paul noted his intention was to finish and present the work during the RSSAC Caucus meeting at IETF 106.

RSSAC002v3 Update

Andrew McConachie noted that RSSAC002v3 had a recommendation for RSSAC to revisit RSSAC002 every year. He explained that he started the discussions on the Caucus list a couple

of weeks ago and collected seven topics for the update. As for the next steps Andrew committed to draft straw man edits for each of the topics, work to get doodle polls circulated to organize calls where RSSAC Caucus members could discuss two topics at a time.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to circulate doodle polls to organize RSSAC Caucus calls in order to update RSSAC002v3 .

Reports

Co-Chairs

Fred Baker listed a number of activities including the wrap up of two active work parties, RSSAC002v3 update, Chair/Vice Chair model and upcoming Vice Chair elections. Brad Verd added that Fred and he would have the regular pre-ICANN meeting call with Göran Marby in about two weeks and invited the RSSAC to share any topics that they wanted the Co-Chairs to bring up in this call.

ICANN Board

Kaveh Ranjbar noted he had no update other than the BTC meeting report which he shared earlier in the meeting.

CSC

Lars-Johan Liman reported that CSC had an interesting situation where they had two vacancies out of the four voting members and he became the interim Chair of the group as a result. Liman added that the process to refill the vacancies was underway. He reminded RSSAC that the entire slate of candidates had to be approved by both the ccNSO and GNSO. Liman also added that he would chair the October meeting yet he was not sure they would be able to elect a new Chair in this meeting or the election would be deferred to the November meeting.

Lars-Johan Liman talked through the amendments to the procedures document in order to clarify how to conduct work in case of vacancies. Lastly, Liman mentioned the SLAs in the contracts for the PTI operations. He reported that CSC had a number of reports where PTI was not able to report fully in compliance with the contract due to the thresholds that were too low. Despite the heavy weight process for changing them Liman noted that the CSC proposed a change so that PTI could provide better reports.

RZERC

Brad Verd mentioned that the RZERC would have its annual meeting in Montreal but there were no specific items on the agenda. Brad also added that the briefing to the GAC by the RSSAC Co-Chairs regarding RSSAC037 and RSSAC038 on Saturday, 2 November at 17:00 local time was not on the general RSSAC ICANN66 schedule yet the session would be open to the public and everyone was welcome.

SSAC

Russ Mundy noted that he was happy to see that the SSAC's request to have a vote in the Governance Working Group was going to be accepted. Russ reported that the other big item for the SSAC was the work of its work party on DoH and DoT. Russ believed that the RSSAC would be interested to hear what RSSAC would say, possibly in November, in these regards. Russ also invited the RSSAC members to share with him any agenda items of their interest for the joint meeting with the SSAC in Montreal. Lastly, Russ pointed out that the DNSSEC workshop was moved to Wednesday afternoon on ICANN66 schedule and the RSSAC members were more than welcome to suggest agenda items for the workshop.

Brad Verd wondered whether it would be a good idea to add RPKI as an agenda item for the joint meeting of the RSSAC and SSAC. Terry Manderson responded that it would probably be premature given that root server operators wanted to have a discussion about the problem statement first.

IAB

Daniel Migault had no update.

IANA Functions Operator

Naela Sarras reported that PTI had its annual engagement survey open. Naela noted that some of the root server operators might have received this survey and encouraged them to complete it by 11 October 2019. Naela also pointed out that the PTI budget would soon be open for public comment and gave brief information on the PTI budget cycle. Naela then reminded the group of the IANA updates she provided in Marrakech at ICANN65 including the fact that the data in IANA was not always up to date on who the root server operators were and how they could get in touch with the RSOs. Naela said she reached out to some of the RSO representatives during the workshop and asked for their help to address this issue.

Duane Wessels added that RSOs had an internal system where they maintained the contacts. He explained that they have been working on making slight modifications so that RSOs who wanted to be listed as IANA contacts could do so. Duane said that they would be providing the list to IANA on a monthly basis once they got the final approval from RSOs in November. Russ Mundy mentioned the intention of IANA/PTI to give a draft plan for the next KSK rollover. Russ asked Naela if that was still on schedule. Naela responded that this work was in progress. She noted that they were planning to have an IANA session at ICANN66 where they would go into that specific topic. She took it as an action item to check with Kim to see if that document was ready. Russ thanked Naela and replied that he would appreciate if Kim would be willing to do a presentation on this topic at the DNSSEC workshop.

ACTION ITEM: Naela to check if a draft plan report of the next KSK rollover is ready and Kim Davies would be available for a presentation at the DNSSEC workshop.

Root Zone Maintainer

Duane Wessels had no update.

Any Other Business

Fred Baker reminded the RSSAC that the next RSSAC monthly meeting would take place on Wednesday, 6 November at ICANN66.

Wes Hardaker wanted to know what the status of RSSAC000v4 and its process to get through voting were. Carlos Reyes responded that the RSSAC was waiting for the Empowered Community review process.

Wes suggested to reopen RSSAC000 again to address meeting times once this was settled as he thought it was inappropriate to change this meeting's time with only twenty minutes of advanced notice. He continued that most organizations had a requirement for advanced notice of new meetings in the interest of transparency and to protect members being slighted from participating or voting on a topic. Wes noted that RSSAC000 talked about emergency meetings as well as the timing around them however it did not discuss required advanced notice with respect to creating and holding meetings. Wes concluded that RSSAC000 had to have a minimum of advanced notice time for scheduling meetings and three days was a common value for many other organizations.

Fred Baker responded that they could take that up in November and apologized for the inconvenience due to the change of meeting time with a short notice.

Adjournment

The RSSAC concluded the meeting without objections.